Jason Canales CANALES PLLC 7 Penn Plaza, Suite 914 New York, New York 10001 Telephone: (212) 988-2039 Email: jason@canalespllc.com

Attorneys for Edvin Ovasapyan
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

PAYMENTECH, LLC AND JPMORGAN CHASE BANK, N.A.,

Plaintiffs,

-against-

MAINSPRING DISTRIBUTION LLC AND RIA PHILIP,

Defendants.

RIA PHILIP,

Third-Party Plaintiff,

-against-

EDVIN OVASAPYAN AND VAHE OVASAPYAN,

Third-Party Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:19-cv-02087

EDVIN OVASAPYAN'S ANSWER AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES TO THIRD-PARTY COMPLAINT

Defendant, Edvin Ovasapyan, by and through his attorneys, Canales PLLC, hereby answers the Third-Party Complaint of the Third-Party Plaintiff, Ria Philip, as follows:

## THE PARTIES

1. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 1 of the Third-Party Complaint.

- 2. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 2 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 3. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 3 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 4. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 4 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 5. Admits the allegations contained in paragraph 5 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 6. Admits the allegations contained in paragraph 6 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 7. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 7 of the Third-Party Complaint.

# **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

- 8. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 8 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 9. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 9 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 10. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 10 of the Third-Party Complaint.

## THE FIRST PARTY ACTION

- 11. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 11 of the Third-Party Complaint and respectfully refers the Court to the first party complaint for its contents.
- 12. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 12 of the Third-Party Complaint and respectfully refers the Court to the first party complaint for its contents.
- 13. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 13 of the Third-Party Complaint and respectfully refers the Court to the first party complaint for its contents.

## **FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS**

- 14. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 14 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 15. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 15 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 16. Admits that Edvin had, at some point, an ownership interest in Mainspring but otherwise denies the allegations as stated in paragraph 16 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 17. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 17 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 18. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 18 of the Third-Party Complaint, except admits that Vahe is related to Edvin.
- 19. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 19 of the Third- Party Complaint, except admits that, at some point, Vahe became a part owner of Mainspring.
- 20. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 20 of the Third-Party Complaint and states that to the extent the Third-Party Plaintiff relies on and/or refers to the Amended Operating Agreement for Mainspring, the contract speaks for itself.
- 21. Lacks knowledge sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 21 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 22. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 22 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 23. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 23 of the Third-Party Complaint, except admits that on August 7, 2018, Edvin pled guilty in the District Court of Puerto Rico.
- 24. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 24 of the Third-Party Complaint.

- 25. Admit the allegations contained in paragraph 25 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 26. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 26 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 27. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 27 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 28. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 28 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 29. Denies the allegations contained in paragraph 29 of the Third-Party Complaint.
- 30. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 30 of the Third-Party Complaint

### FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION

- 31. Repeats and realleges its responses to the Third-party Complaint as set forth in this Answer.
- 32. Paragraph 32 of the Third-Party Complaint contains improper legal conclusions for which no response is required. To the extent a response is required, deny the allegations set forth in paragraph 32 as stated.
- 33. Paragraph 33 of the Third-Party Complaint contains improper legal conclusions for which no response is required. To the extent a response is required, deny the allegations set forth in paragraph 33 as stated.
- 34. Paragraph 34 of the Third-Party Complaint contains improper legal conclusions for which no response is required. To the extent a response is required, deny the allegations set forth in paragraph 34 as stated.
- 35. Paragraph 35 of the Third-Party Complaint contains improper legal conclusions for which no response is required. To the extent a response is required, deny the allegations set forth in paragraph 35 as stated.

36. Paragraph 36 of the Third-Party Complaint contains improper legal conclusions for which no response is required. To the extent a response is required, deny the allegations set forth in paragraph 36 as stated.

## **SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION**

- 37. Repeats and realleges its responses to the Third-Party Complaint as set forth in this Answer.
- 38. Lacks knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief about the truth of the allegations contained in paragraph 38 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 39. Denies the allegations set forth in paragraph 39 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 40. Denies the allegations set forth in paragraph 40 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 41. Denies the allegations set forth in paragraph 41 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 42. Denies the allegations set forth in paragraph 42 of the Third-Party Complaint.

## **THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION**

- 43. Repeats and realleges its responses to the Third-Party Complaint as set forth in this Answer.
  - 44. Denies the allegations set forth in paragraph 44 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 45. Denies the allegations set forth in paragraph 45 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 46. Denies the allegations set forth in paragraph 46 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 47. Denies the allegations set forth in paragraph 47 of the Third-Party Complaint.
  - 48. Denies the allegations set forth in paragraph 48 of the Third-Party Complaint

## **DEFENSES**

## FIRST DEFENSE

The Third-Party Complaint fails to state a cause of action upon which relief can be granted.

### **SECOND DEFENSE**

Third-Party Plaintiff's claims are barred, in whole or in part, by documentary evidence.

### THIRD DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, by plaintiff's material breach of contract.

# FOURTH DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiffs' claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrines of laches and unclean hands.

### FIFTH DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiff's damages, if any, were the result of its own conduct or that of other parties named or not named in the Third-Party Complaint.

#### SIXTH DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiff's claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrines of modification and ratification.

### SEVENTH DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiff's claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrines of waiver, ratification and / or estoppel.

### **EIGHTH DEFENSE**

Third-Party Plaintiff's claims are barred, in whole or in part, by improper notice of defect.

#### NINTH DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiff's claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrine of impossibility of performance.

### TENTH DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiff's claims are barred, in whole or in part, failure to join a necessary party.

### **ELEVENTH DEFENSE**

Third-Party Plaintiff's claims are barred, in whole or in part, by fraud and/or illegality.

### TWELFTH DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiff's claims are barred, in whole or in part, by the statute of frauds.

## THIRTEENTH DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiff's claims and damages are barred, in whole or in part, by failure to mitigate damages.

### FOURTEENTH DEFENSE

Third-Party Plaintiff has failed to plead its claims with the requisite specificity as required under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 9(b).

### RESERVATION OF ADDITIONAL DEFENSES

Third-Party Defendant expressly reserves the right to assert and rely upon any and all additional defenses that may be relevant or become relevant during the course of this action.

## **PRAYER**

WHEREFORE, Defendant prays as follows:

- 1. For dismissal of the Third-Party Complaint with prejudice;
- 2. For a judgment in favor of Third-Party Defendant and against Third-Party Plaintiff;
- 3. For costs of suit incurred herein; and
- 4. For such other and further relief as the Court may deem just and proper.

Dated: New York, New York January 17, 2020

## CANALES PLLC

By: /s/ Jason Canales
 Jason Canales
7 Penn Plaza, Suite 914
New York, New York 10001
Telephone: (212) 988-2039
Email: jason@canalespllc.com
Attorneys for Edvin Ovasapyan